

JOSEPH H. HUNT  
*Assistant Attorney General*  
 SCOTT G. STEWART  
*Deputy Assistant Attorney General*  
 WILLIAM C. PEACHEY  
*Director*  
 Office of Immigration Litigation  
 District Court Section  
 EREZ REUVENI  
*Assistant Director*  
 PATRICK GLEN  
*Senior Litigation Counsel*  
 T. BENTON YORK  
*Trial Attorney*  
 ARCHITH RAMKUMAR  
*Trial Attorney*  
 U.S. Department of Justice  
 Civil Division  
 Office of Immigration Litigation  
 District Court Section  
 P.O. Box 868, Ben Franklin Station  
 Washington, DC 20044  
 Tel: (202) 598-8060  
 Archith.Ramkumar@usdoj.gov

Judy Rabinovitz\*  
 ACLU FOUNDATION  
 IMMIGRANTS' RIGHTS PROJECT  
 125 Broad Street, 18th Floor  
 New York, NY 10004  
 T: (212) 549-2660  
 F: (212) 549-2654  
 jrabinovitz@aclu.org  
  
*Attorney for Plaintiffs*

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
 FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Innovation Law Lab, *et al.*,  
  
 Plaintiffs,  
  
 v.  
  
 Kirstjen Nielsen, *et al.*,  
  
 Defendants.  
 \_\_\_\_\_

Civil Action No. 3:19-cv-0807-RS

**ORDER  
 THE PARTIES' JOINT STIPULATION  
 FOR AN EXTENSION OF TIME  
 TO RESPOND TO UPCOMING  
 DEADLINES**

1 The parties hereby jointly stipulate to an extension of time for: (1) Defendants to answer  
 2 or otherwise respond to the Complaint; and (2) the parties to file their initial case management  
 3 statement, along with a corresponding extension of the date of the initial case management  
 4 conference. The parties offer the following support for their stipulation:

5 1. Plaintiffs filed their Complaint on February 14, 2019, *see* Dkt. 1, and served their  
 6 Complaint on Defendants on February 28, 2019.

7 2. On April 8, 2019, this Court granted Plaintiffs' motion for a preliminary  
 8 injunction. *See* Dkt. 73. Thereafter, Defendants filed a notice of appeal from this Court's  
 9 order. *See* Dkt. 75.

10 3. Subsequently, the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit set a deadline of  
 11 May 8, 2019 for Defendants to file their opening brief. *See Innovation Law Lab et al. v.*  
 12 *Kirstjen Nielsen et al.*, No. 19-15716, Dkt. 2 (9th Cir. Apr. 11, 2019). In addition,  
 13 Defendants "exercise[d] their right to seek a stay from the Court of Appeal[s]," Dkt. 73 at 26,  
 14 and, in the interim, the Ninth Circuit administratively stayed the preliminary injunction  
 15 pending consideration of Defendants' motion to stay. *See Innovation Law Lab et al. v.*  
 16 *Kirstjen Nielsen et al.*, No. 19-15716, Dkt. 6 (9th Cir. Apr. 12, 2019).

17 4. In view of the pending Ninth Circuit litigation, this Court granted Defendants'  
 18 consent motion for a 30-day extension of time to answer or otherwise respond to the  
 19 Complaint on or before May 29, 2019. *See* Dkt. 79.

20 5. On April 26, the Ninth Circuit issued an Order modifying the briefing schedule  
 21 while the panel considered Defendants' motion for a stay. As a result of the Order, the  
 22 deadline for Defendants to submit their opening brief is now May 22. *See Innovation Law*  
 23 *Lab et al. v. Kirstjen Nielsen et al.*, No. 19-15716, Dkt. 20 (9th Cir. Apr. 20, 2019).

24 6. On May 7, the Ninth Circuit, in a published opinion, granted Defendants' motion  
 25 for a stay, finding that Defendants were "likely to prevail" on Plaintiffs' claims that the  
 26 Migrant Protection Protocols (MPP) lacks statutory authorization and that MPP should have  
 27 gone through notice and comment rulemaking, the only claims that "could justify a  
 28 nationwide injunction halting the implementation of the MPP on a wholesale basis," and that

1 “[t]he remaining factors governing issuance of a stay pending appeal weigh in the  
 2 government’s favor.” *Innovation Law Lab et al. v. Kirstjen Nielsen et al.*, No. 19-15716, ---  
 3 F.3d ----, 2019 WL 2005745\*1-5 (9th Cir. May 7, 2019).

4 7. Defendants’ opening brief in the Ninth Circuit remains due on May 22, while  
 5 Plaintiffs’ answering brief is due on June 19. Defendants’ reply brief is due within 21 days  
 6 after service of Plaintiffs’ answering brief. *See Innovation Law Lab et al. v. Kirstjen Nielsen*  
 7 *et al.*, No. 19-15716, Dkt. 20 (9th Cir. Apr. 20, 2019).

8 8. In light of these developments, Defendants request an additional 60-day extension  
 9 of time to answer or otherwise respond to the Complaint so that their response must be filed  
 10 on or before July 29, 2019. Plaintiffs have consented to this request.

11 9. In addition, the parties seek to extend the deadline for the filing of the case  
 12 management statement, which is currently due by May 16, *see* Dkt. 36, until May 30, 2019.  
 13 The parties seek a corresponding extension of the initial case management conference,  
 14 currently scheduled for May 23. *See* Dkt. 36.

15 10. The parties further note that they have initially met and conferred concerning how  
 16 this case should proceed in light of the Ninth Circuit’s stay of the injunction and the  
 17 upcoming merits briefing in Defendant’s appeal.

- 18 a. Plaintiffs believe they are entitled to limited discovery, and wish to meet and  
 19 confer concerning discovery as part of preparation of the case management  
 20 statement. Plaintiffs believe that, consistent with Ninth Circuit authority, district  
 21 court proceedings in this case should proceed pending the interlocutory appeal,  
 22 and discovery is appropriate and necessary, at a minimum, with regard to details  
 23 of the agency procedures governing the assessment of fear of return to Mexico. In  
 24 addition, the completeness of the administrative record has not been resolved.
- 25 b. Defendants believe discovery is inappropriate in an Administrative Procedure Act  
 26 case such as this where they have already served the certified administrative  
 27 record, where the pending appeal involves the same certified administrative  
 28 record, and where no answer or responsive pleading has yet been filed.

1 Accordingly, Defendants notify the court of their intention, should the parties not  
2 reach an agreement on how this case should proceed or on discovery matters, to  
3 move to stay proceedings in district court pending resolution of the appeal.

4 //

5 //

6 //

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Respectfully submitted,

JOSEPH H. HUNT  
Assistant Attorney General

SCOTT G. STEWART  
Deputy Assistant Attorney General

WILLIAM C. PEACHEY  
Director

EREZ REUVENI  
Assistant Director

PATRICK GLEN  
Senior Litigation Counsel

T. BENTON YORK  
Trial Attorney

/s/ Archith Ramkumar  
ARCHITH RAMKUMAR  
Trial Attorney  
N.Y.B. No. 5269949  
U.S. Department of Justice  
Civil Division  
Office of Immigration Litigation  
District Court Section  
P.O. Box 868, Ben Franklin Station  
Washington, DC 20044  
Tel: (202) 598-8060  
Archith.Ramkumar@usdoj.gov

Dated: May 16, 2019

*Attorneys for Defendants*

/s/ Judy Rabinovitz  
Judy Rabinovitz\*  
ACLU FOUNDATION  
IMMIGRANTS' RIGHTS PROJECT  
125 Broad Street, 18th Floor  
New York, NY 10004  
T: (212) 549-2660  
F: (212) 549-2654  
jrabinovitz@aclu.org

Dated: May 16, 2019

*Attorney for Plaintiffs*

**[PROPOSED] ORDER**

PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that:

1. Defendants must respond to the Complaint on or before July 29, 2019.
2. The initial case management statement must be filed on or before May 30, 2019.
3. The initial case management conference will be held one week after the filing of the initial case management statement.

Issued this 20th day of May, 2019

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Richard L. Schumacher", is written over a horizontal line.

United States District Judge

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on May 16, 2019, I electronically filed the foregoing document with the Clerk of the Court for the United States Court of for the Northern District of California by using the CM/ECF system. Counsel in the case are registered CM/ECF users and service will be accomplished by the CM/ECF system.

By: /s/ Archith Ramkumar  
Archith Ramkumar  
Trial Attorney  
United States Department of Justice  
Civil Division